- 1 thing.
- 2 Q. Do you have any subspecialties within the
- 3 field of rheumatology that you focus on or you
- 4 generally treat?
- 5 A. Well, it's all clinical. I don't do
- 6 research or scientific type investigations.
- 7 Q. But you don't focus on any particular one
- 8 of these rheumatology diseases you treat?
- 9 A. No. It just works out that rheumatoid is
- 10 probably the most time consuming. Certainly,
- 11 that's the bulk of the difficult cases that we
- 12 see.
- 13 Q. From what medical school did you
- 14 graduate?
- 15 A. University of Tennessee here in Memphis.
- 16 Q. And what year did you graduate?
- 17 A. 1963.
- 18 Q. And after you graduated from medical
- 19 school, did you complete any internships?
- 20 A. I went to the Graduate Hospital at
- 21 University of Pennsylvania for a year of
- 22 general internship there.
- 23 Q. And in what field of medicine did you do
- that internship?

- 1 increasing vertebral body fractures. And we,
- 2 she had an innate intolerance to the usual
- disease modifying agents. So this was a new
- 4 option to consider, and we gave it strong
- 5 consideration.
- 6 Q. Does this note mean that you had started
- 7 discussing the option of Remicade with
- 8 Ms. Jones?
- 9 MR. PERDUE: Object to the form.
- 10 Q. (BY MR. BAUTISTA:) You can go ahead and
- 11 answer the question. He just stated an
- 12 objection for the record.
- 13 A. Oh, that's what he was doing?
- 14 Q. Yeah.
- 15 A. I couldn't -- yes.
- 16 Q. And generally, in this time period, could
- 17 you tell me how you would explain the TNF
- 18 inhibitor option to patients like Ms. Jones?
- 19 A. I would just translate the previous
- 20 paragraph that you verbalized, trying to make
- 21 it simple but informative. And it would be an
- 22 option that we should consider, and give her a
- 23 rundown on the risks and the benefits, and
- 24 potential toxic reactions, and to weigh it,

- 1 and we'll think about it and talk about it. I
- 2 was in favor of giving it a trial, personally.
- 3 But it was her decision to, to make. It
- 4 always is.
- 5 Q. Right. Let's see. If we could move
- forward to Adams Page 83, which is now in the
- 7 end of 2000, in December of 2000. There's a
- 8 report from you dated December 29th, 2000. I
- 9 believe it says increased something,
- 10 arthritis?
- 11 A. Polyarthritis. It's inflammation of the
- 12 joints.
- 13 Q. So at this point in December of 2000,
- she, her rheumatoid arthritis is progressing
- 15 even worse?
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 Q. And so you make a note that she, you
- 18 really need to, really must -- well, I'm not
- 19 exactly sure what that sentence is. It says
- something, really something, TNF prescription?
- 21 A. Really needs TNF treatment. That's my,
- 22 that was my judgment call.
- 23 Q. So as we were discussing earlier, for all
- 24 the reasons of her advanced disease state, and

- 1 is 2004?
- 2 Q. Yes.
- 3 A. The drug had only been out a year. There
- 4 wasn't a whole lot of story line about that
- 5 drug at that time in terms of -- any of the
- 6 TNF's was a kind of a whisper in the
- 7 background about the risks of lymphomas. And
- 8 it wasn't absolutely clear at that point where
- 9 we stood. It still doesn't, for that matter,
- in my mind. But in general, yeah, I went over
- 11 everything with her the best I could, and you
- 12 know, always presented a fair minded picture
- 13 where I thought we should go. I still think
- 14 it was the logical thing to do, that which we
- 15 chose to do, and why we did it.
- 16 Q. So after balancing the benefits against
- 17 the risks, you reached in your independent
- 18 clinical medical judgment to prescribe Humira
- 19 to Ms. Jones in late 2004?
- 20 A. I did.
- 21 Q. And so in your decision to prescribe
- 22 Humira, it was your clinical judgment that the
- 23 likely benefits of Humira outweighed the
- 24 potential risks or side effects from the drug?

- 1 rheumatoid arthritis?
- 2 A. Yes.
- MR. PERDUE: I object to the form.
- 4 A. I think I heard you right.
- 5 Q. Today you continue to when you are
- 6 prescribing, decision making to consider the
- 7 studies where they are attempting to --
- 8 attempting to determine whether there is an
- 9 increased risk of lymphoma in rheumatoid
- 10 arthritis patients on biologics compared to
- 11 rheumatoid arthritis patients who are not on
- 12 biologics?
- 13 A. I think that is fair. I would say that
- 14 the dialogue has become more dispersed in the
- 15 arthritis rheumatoid family, if you will, so
- it doesn't come as a shock out of the bolt,
- 17 out of the blue when you bring that up. But I
- 18 still present it as an unknown fact and yes,
- 19 I'm sorry, sir, but that there is a risk of
- 20 lymphoma with your disease. And whether it is
- 21 exaggerated with the drug we haven't yet
- 22 proven yet. And but it is I do -- I speak in
- that term more and more with each patient at
- 24 this stage of the game.

- 1 This statement I think is apropos. I don't
- 2 have any problem with the while patients with
- 3 RA may have higher risks for the development
- 4 of lymphoma, and the role is not known. That
- 5 label is -- I mean, I agree with that
- 6 entirely.
- 7 Q. So you would agree that warning about
- 8 lymphoma that you just read in the December
- 9 2002 label was consistent?
- 10 A. If you call that a warning. It is more
- of a declaration of uncertainty it sounds to
- 12 me like.
- 13 Q. Let me rephrase. You would agree that
- 14 the language in the product label for Humira
- in December of 2002 concerning lymphomas is
- 16 consistent with your understanding of the
- 17 knowledge, the state of the art knowledge
- 18 about the risk of lymphoma from TNF inhibitors
- 19 at that time period?
- MR. PERDUE: Object to the form.
- 21 A. I accept that. Yes.
- 22 Q. (BY MR. BAUTISTA:) Looking at what has
- 23 just been given to you marked as Exhibit 4.
- 24 So I think you had explained to us during a

- 1 A. I'm glad you did. I would think if
- 2 Abbott really wanted me to do that, that they
- 3 would come and sit me down and give me who,
- 4 what, why, when, where about it precisely.
- 5 Abbott may have a different perspective than I
- 6 think the patient has. Abbott may be
- 7 protecting their own skin, and in the process
- 8 they don't care if three people get scared
- 9 off, they are going to, you know, they may
- 10 come out that they have got so many patients
- 11 dying for it that they don't care. But the
- 12 three they lost may be the three that should
- have gotten it in the first place. It is very
- 14 philosophical. It is not black or white, and
- 15 I'm sympathetic to every question you are
- asking me, and I wish it was a perfect world
- 17 and I wish I was a perfect physician.
- 18 Q. Do you have any recollection of any
- 19 Abbott sales representatives ever --
- 20 A. I don't. I don't. We talk all the time.
- 21 They are there, you know, every two weeks. We
- 22 have all sorts of discussions.
- 23 O. Do you recall somebody by the name of
- 24 Kirkland LaLance? Does that name ring a bell

- 1 conversation regarding a prescription; fair?
- 2 Is that true?
- 3 A. I say yes. Okay.
- 4 Q. I am wondering if you ever recall
- 5 presenting the actual written informed consent
- 6 form for the use of Humira to a patient
- 7 enrolled in the HERO Study?
- 8 A. I don't know. I tell you what, what
- 9 really happens is that all that happens before
- 10 I mean, beyond around me. I have a team of
- 11 people that run all of these studies, and I
- 12 really, I am just the physician. That type of
- 13 data for better for worse is not my forte and
- I don't have time to do. That is not the way
- 15 to answer it, but I really don't deal with the
- 16 persnickety details.
- 17 Q. I take it by that, anything that is a
- 18 communication into your office related to a
- 19 clinical study on Humira in which Ms. Inman is
- 20 copied, she probably took it and was in charge
- 21 of it?
- 22 A. You better believe it. You are talking
- 23 to the wrong person here.
- 24 Q. I get that impression. For any financial

- 1 but I don't remember exactly anything precise.
- 2 I just don't know. It has been a long time
- 3 ago.
- 4 Q. Was Ms. Jones a patient who was compliant
- 5 with your medical instructions?
- 6 A. I think so. It might have been a few
- 7 times when she decided she wanted to do her
- 8 things her way, which is, you know, she is a
- 9 lovely lady. I enjoyed her very much. No
- 10 real conflict that was serious. I saw those
- 11 notes in there we presented her with an option
- of, what was the -- we discussed an option
- 13 with two pharmaceuticals, and she chose the
- 14 Amgen route. And I can't remember whether
- 15 that is the one she chose. We talked about
- 16 it, and it is in the record there.
- 17 Q. Yeah, I was trying to figure out. Do you
- 18 know what, the other word is Narvotis?
- 19 A. The other is Narvotis, that's correct.
- 20 Yes.
- 21 Q. What TNF blocker, to your knowledge, is
- 22 manufactured by Narvotis?
- 23 A. I don't know. I can't remember.
- Q. When you used the term lymphoma overlap

- 1 follow-up questions based on the questioning
- 2 that you have went through with Mr. Perdue, if
- 3 you are done.
- 4 MR. PERDUE: I pass the witness.
- 5 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 6 BY MR. BAUTISTA:
- 7 Q. Do you recall questioning by Mr. Perdue
- 8 about the compensation you received for your
- 9 participation as a clinical investigator in
- 10 the HERO clinical studies sponsored by Abbott?
- 11 Do you recall that line of questioning?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Would it be fair to say that
- 14 participation, or compensation for
- 15 participation in clinical studies is not a
- 16 significant source of revenue for you?
- 17 A. Yes. Say that again, and let me think
- 18 through that now.
- 19 Q. Could you go ahead, so it is said
- 20 correctly.
- 21 (Whereupon, the question was read
- 22 by the reporter.)
- 23 A. I withdraw that. No, I think it is
- 24 significant.

- 1 know, direct payments for, you know, putting
- 2 patients on Humira as opposed to some other
- 3 TNF inhibitor; is that correct?
- 4 MR. PERDUE: Object to the form.
- 5 A. Is that a contradiction?
- 6 Q. Let me say it this way. You didn't
- 7 receive payments from TNF inhibitor companies
- 8 to, you know, prescribe, you know, that
- 9 company's TNF inhibitor to a patient?
- MR. PERDUE: Object to the form.
- 11 A. Are you not contradicting yourself when
- 12 you say that?
- 13 O. Okay. Maybe I am stating it --
- 14 A. Let me make one comment here. I never --
- this study, and I have never had a situation
- 16 quite like that in my whole career at this
- 17 quote unquote, HERO Study. And I wasn't happy
- 18 with it, and I wasn't proud of it. It just
- 19 was what they came up with and that was the
- 20 only way I could access patients into this
- 21 drug. And most -- you asked about the -- I
- 22 would like to defend myself here. Most drug
- 23 studies are not compensated on find a patient
- 24 and I will give you a check. They are

- 1 compensated for doing a research project of a
- 2 double-blind placebo controlled nature that
- 3 are very valuable studies. And they are
- 4 scientifically based and yeah, there is
- 5 compensation for it, but a hell of a lot of
- 6 work and it is very dedicated work. This is a
- 7 little obtuse as far as I'm concerned.
- 8 I played ball with them simply to
- 9 get access to the drug for patients that were
- in need. These drugs are extremely valuable,
- and yes, they have their potholes, but they
- 12 are extremely valuable to the masses for
- 13 treatment of rheumatoid arthritis, and many,
- 14 many people cannot afford them. And I
- 15 guarantee Abbott no longer pays anybody for
- 16 patients on their pills.
- 17 Q. Do you remember the line of questioning
- 18 about Abbott salespersons?
- 19 A. I was thinking to myself. Go ahead, I'm
- 20 sorry. I lost my train of thought.
- 21 Q. Do you recall the line of questioning
- from Mr. Perdue about Abbott salespersons
- having conversations with you about Humira?
- 24 A. Yeah, I just was vague on it but, yeah.

- 1 So? I'm sure they did if he found it in
- 2 there, but I don't recall.
- Q. But all the time --
- 4 A. And I seek these guys out for information
- 5 all the time. Don't get me wrong, I ask them
- 6 everything I can think to ask them. And they
- 7 are usually great resources. We have
- 8 excellent relationships with these people, the
- 9 detail people.
- 10 Q. But you make your own independent
- 11 decision on what drug to prescribe a patient
- 12 notwithstanding what any company salesperson
- 13 says to you?
- 14 A. Absolutely. Of course. Just like in
- 15 this case, I gave this lady two options, and
- 16 the only two I could think that she could
- 17 possibly afford, and I was going to have to
- 18 work to get those. She chose the one we used.
- 19 It was her choice, not mine.
- 20 Q. Then my final set of questions. You
- 21 never made any assessment or determination
- 22 about the cause of Ms. Jones' lymphoma; is
- 23 that correct?
- 24 A. I never was asked. I say that and I

```
1
         COURT REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE
     STATE OF TENNESSEE:
 2
     COUNTY OF SHELBY:
        I, MADELYN GRAY, Reporter and Notary
 4
 5
     Public, Shelby County, Tennessee, CERTIFY:
 6
        1. The foregoing deposition was taken
 7
     before me at the time and place stated in the
 8
     foregoing styled cause with the appearances as
 9
     noted;
        2. Being a Court Reporter, I then reported
10
11
     the deposition in Stenotype to the best of my
12
     skill and ability, and the foregoing pages
     contain a full, true and correct transcript of
13
14
     my said Stenotype notes then and there taken;
15
        3. I am not in the employ of and am not
     related to any of the parties or their
16
17
     counsel, and I have no interest in the matter
18
     involved.
19
        WITNESS MY SIGNATURE, this, the day of
20
         _____, 2011.
21
22
     MADELYN GRAY, Court Reporter,
23
     Notary Public for the State of
     Tennessee at Large * * *
24
     My Commission Expires: February 2012
```